

ably draws on court cases and other evidence to show how gendered assumptions and discourses could serve, at once, to oppress and, in turn, to resist depending on a number of circumstances. Similarly, she shows, state patriarchy and an 'alternative' indigenous patriarchy could come together in ways that could be detrimental or beneficial to indigenous males and/or females depending on a number of factors, not the least of which was the context (the indigenous community or the hacienda) in which these forms of patriarchy came together. Gender and, in particular, the interplay of state and indigenous patriarchies, O'Connor demonstrates, shaped relations between the elite and the indigenous but also, more specifically, between elite males and indigenous men, between elite men and indigenous women, between elite women and indigenous men, between elite women and indigenous women (though this combination receives less attention than others), and, finally, between indigenous men and indigenous women in differentiated ways.

Generally, I was persuaded by the argument this book puts forward and impressed by the evidence it marshals and the general clarity of its presentation. Inevitably, given the nature of the sources used, O'Connor sometimes makes generalizations from a few cases, but these generalizations ring true for the most part. Working in the Andes, it is always tempting to turn to anthropological evidence when direct historical evidence is thin. Although she invokes some anthropological studies, O'Connor discusses them carefully and resists substituting anthropological evidence for absent historical sources. Though she briefly discusses how elites perceived lowland or Amazonian Indians, I felt that O'Connor could have given more attention to regional specificities. Similarly, in places the discussion of the evidence drawn from the court cases comes across as somewhat detached from a specific historical context. The final chapter, which seeks to suggest ways in which the history discussed in the previous chapters can inform or explain the experience of mid-twentieth century and contemporary female indigenous activists, seemed hurriedly put together and was not fully convincing. More generally, I felt the structure of the book resulted in a fair amount of repetition. But overall, O'Connor has produced a well-researched and well-argued book that will be of benefit to students of the history of state-indigenous relations in the Andes and Latin America more generally and to scholars interested in the ways in which gender analysis may be usefully applied to historical study.

Paulo Drinot
History, University of Manchester

- *Escenarios para una patria: Paisajismo ecuatoriano, 1850-1930*, edited by Alexandra Kennedy-Troya. Quito: Museo de la Ciudad, 2008.
- *Indians and Leftists in the Making of Ecuador's Modern Indigenous Movements*, by Marc Becker. Durham & London: Duke University Press, 2008.

The nature of the Ecuadorian nation has been hotly debated, both today and in the past. It started in the nineteenth century with the debates on the political organization and administrative structure of the new republic and has not abated until our day. In this long period, however, the contents of the debates concerning the Ecuadorian nation-state radically changed. This was basically the result of some long-

term historical developments. First there was the economic and cultural globalization which started at the end of the nineteenth century and which transformed the Latin American societies, economically, but also cultural and politically. From the late nineteenth century onwards, the emerging dominance of liberal politics in the country created new channels of political participation, education and social communication. Finally and partly influenced by these earlier changes, the country experienced the mobilization of the indigenous peasant population and the resulting intense debates on the agrarian reform and a possible multicultural society.

These developments have asked urgent questions as to the make-up of Ecuadorian society and its historical constitution. What is the essence of Ecuadorian national identity and who may rightfully consider themselves its members? These two books, each in their own way, address these questions. They demonstrate how strongly the discussion has evolved but also how this evolution has directly influenced, albeit in different and sometimes contrasting ways, the historiography of the country.

In 2008 the Museo de la Ciudad in Quito organized a large exhibition on the production of artistic images of the Ecuadorian landscape and its connection with the process of nation-building in this country. Not surprisingly the exhibition focused on the period 1850-1930 when the focus on the Ecuadorian nation-building reached its peak. On the occasion of this exhibition a book was published in which many paintings were reproduced and analysed. The book consists of eight informative and well-written essays some of the best Ecuadorian historians which describe and analyse the connection between the pictorial imagination of the Ecuadorian geography and national identity. The result is an exciting and beautiful book. Its beautiful reproduction of paintings and images make it a joy to leaf through. The articles provide interesting material to better understand the background and meaning of these images. They are not simply explaining the images, but they place them into the context of the historical period in which they were produced and explain them as part of the specific intellectual history of Ecuador.

The essays in this book highlight the importance of the geographical imagination for the idea of a homogeneous – and in certain ways unique – Ecuadorian nation. Many intellectuals and painters viewed the mountains, volcanoes and the rugged countryside as eminently constitutive of the idea of Ecuador. This is what the curator of the exposition and the collection's editor Alexandra Kennedy-Troya calls 'la nacionalización del paisaje'. She observes: 'las imágenes que se crean o re-crean [...] invocan creencias, sensaciones, necesidades de un continente y sus naciones que se están formulando bajo el signo de la independencia y la autonomía; la urgencia de distinguir una nación de otra; de imponer nuevos límites o de resaltar costumbres propias' (p. 12).

Added to these nationalist feelings, an urgent desire for modernization emerged towards the end of the nineteenth century. This meant that roads and railroads, trains and cars found their way into the Ecuadorian imagination. These and other signs of modernity, such as depictions of cities and industries, started to be added to the desolate landscapes of before. This did not change the basic idea, however. Nature and the landscape were there to be used by the illustrious elites of the nation to be exploited for the imagination of a great nation. If people were depicted

on these paintings, they either belonged to these elites or they were anonymous, often hardly visible elements accentuating the enormous power of nature.

One of the most interesting aspects of this book, certainly from a contemporary point of view, is the glaring absence of the indigenous population in the nineteenth century paintings. These 'primitive' peoples were, as it were, subsumed in the natural imagination and did not deserve a reproduction of their own. This gradually changed in the beginning of the twentieth century when indigenista ideas also started to influence the pictorial arts. An interesting person, in this respect, was Luis A. Martínez. He wrote the classic novel *A la costa* but at the same time tried to put his ideas on canvas. One of his paintings carried the same name as his novel. His paintings tried for the first time to incorporate elements of indigenous culture in the imagination of the landscape. In his painting *Paisaje* he presents the small peasant huts (chozas) and agricultural fields which were so characteristic of the Ecuadorian landscape. This announced a much more explicit cultural movement in the 1920s and 30s which started to focus on the social problems of Ecuadorian society.

At first sight, the book by Marc Becker on the making of Ecuador's indigenous movement cannot be more different. It is based on a U.S. dissertation with a long bibliography and extensive footnotes (55 pages!) and clearly reflects the present-day fascination in the U.S. with the emergence of the indigenous movements in the Andes. However, these two books, somewhat surprisingly, complement each other quite beautifully. This is especially the result of their joint emphasis on the historical development of political and intellectual ideas in Ecuador. The book on the Ecuadorian pictorial imagination is therefore an excellent and, in many ways, necessary prelude to Marc Becker's book. The pictorial and intellectual history of the first book presents the ideas and images of the urban elites. In contrast, Marc Becker tries to show how the popular classes started to organize themselves slowly but steadily from the 1920s onwards and, often supported by dissident members of these same elites, succeeded in transforming the make up of Ecuadorian society.

There can be no doubt about the unique and dramatic transformation within Ecuadorian society brought about by the indigenous movement. Becker's bottom-up view of this social struggle is a long overdue attempt to put the present-day indigenous movement into a historical perspective. On the basis of extensive empirical research and many new sources and innovative insights, Marc Becker shows how the indigenous struggle in the 1930s and 40s was closely linked to the communists and socialist mobilization of the period. In so doing, he nuances the idea that the communists have always been averse to supporting the indigenous peoples in their struggle for social and ethnic rights. On the contrary, he stresses time and again the clear symbiotic relation between the two movements which was essential to their initial visibility and success. 'Indigenous activists and urban Marxists together imagined a more just social order, and one that re-envisioned social and ethnic divisions in the country' (p. 75). Becker also revises the historical interpretation of the role of the Federación Ecuatoriana de Indios (FEI), which was established in 1944 and had a tortuous and often contradictory existence. Today it is often seen as an organization that betrayed the indigenous struggle, but Becker convincingly argues that this is an anachronistic interpretation that does no justice

to the important and in many ways innovative strategies of the organization in its initial phase. It created a national movement in which different indigenous voices could be articulated, and allowed young activists to obtain the necessary political experience which would be invaluable in the construction of the modern indigenous movements. Although his prose is sometimes a little idiosyncratic and some people will take issue with his points of view, Marc Becker has written a book that will remain a necessary point of reference for many years to come.

Michiel Baud
CEDLA

– *The Imagined Underworld: Sex, Crime, and Vice in Porfirian Mexico City*, by James Alex Garza. Lincoln, NE: University of Nebraska Press, 2007.

This book is the latest in a series of recent studies on criminality in modern Mexico,¹ but it takes a different direction by focusing on the Porfirian elite's creation of an imagined underclass and underworld to reinforce its socio-political legitimacy. Garza works within a revisionist perspective, which envisions little deviation in Porfirian and post-revolutionary elite mentality.

The author shows how urban elites imagined and constructed from the most notorious crimes beginning in the late 1880s a view of the underclass and underworld in order to uphold their moral superiority, create an ideological barrier between the educated and popular classes, and instruct the middle class on proper morality. The elite essentially forged a criminal narrative that ran parallel to the official story, and thus reinforced the 'ideal' modern Europeanized city that President Porfirio Díaz hoped to create. Elite journalists, criminologists, and state officials in tandem produced an official discourse based on trial transcripts, media coverage, and commentary on specific criminal cases, creating an imagined and at times hellish underworld. These elite-created cultural narratives were intended to reinforce Porfirian modernization projects, such urban public works, sanitation systems, modern hygiene, professionalization of the police, and the upholding of elite moral codes. Yet they were also appropriated by popular culture, through broadsides, *corridos*, public trials, and rumours, taking on a life of their own in the imagination and memory of the popular classes.

After charting the eight districts of Mexico City at the end of the nineteenth century, Garza moves on to the dens of iniquity, the *pulquerias*, brothels, prisons, cemeteries, and other public spaces where the vices of drinking, gambling, and prostitution were usually practiced. This provides a context for the mapping out of the underworld inhabited by the underclass. Materials on six very distinct cases found in the archives of the Tribunal Superior de Justicia of Federal District, Archivo General de la Nación, and newspapers make up the body of this study. Violent men and unfaithful women inhabit this world of illicit conjugal relations and domestic turmoil. In the case of Francisco Guerrero, the inveterate serial killer and rapist El Chalequero, government prosecutors in his two trials and the press linked him to the sexual degeneracy, vice, and violent crime of the urban poor in certain neighbourhoods. Yet the belief that illicit sex and violent crime against women were acts only carried out by shiftless immigrants was shattered, when Luis

Copyright of European Review of Latin American & Caribbean Studies is the property of Centre for Latin American Research & Documentation (CEDLA) and its content may not be copied or emailed to multiple sites or posted to a listserv without the copyright holder's express written permission. However, users may print, download, or email articles for individual use.